

Integration and urban mobility of migrant women: Pilot project findings based on knowledge and experience transfer

Melis OĞUZ*, Özlem ÖZÇEVİK**

* Istanbul Technical University, Graduate School of Science, Engineering and Technology, Istanbul, TURKEY

** Istanbul Technical University, Faculty of Architecture, Department of Urban & Regional Planning, Istanbul, TURKEY

Received: October 2014

Final Acceptance: December 2014

Abstract:

This study tries to understand the difficulties migrant women are facing within the city of immigration and the physical barriers in front of their integration to the city. As important parameters to measure the level of integration to the city are public space use and urban mobility taken. The original is the integration of a model from Berlin to Istanbul to provide behavioral and perceptive changes in migrant women's use and awareness of public spaces. This process has the quality of a pilot project, where social and economic integration to the city is ensured via increasing the urban mobility of migrant women.

The social exclusion of women is inherently not just because they are alien to the city and its social, economic system or its physical structuring; but it is more about they remain alien to the city and all the processes related to it. The field study is undertaken by mix-social research methodologies, which we choose to call as Participatory Action towards Experience Transfer (PATET). The analytical outcomes of this process, the path of solution offering, and policy suggestions are tried to be explained in this paper.

Keywords: *Urban mobility, integration, migrant women, experience transfer, public space.*

1. Introduction

Especially in migrant groups who are strictly bound to patriarchal social norms, the social and economic integration of women to the city is difficult. Yet, women are one of the most significant actors in ensuring the social and economic integration and development of the place attachment feelings to the place of migration. However, the role of women in the migration process is usually a neglected phenomenon (Pedraza, 1991). Recent studies have revealed that migrant women are exposed to social exclusion, language barriers, cultural conflicts, scarceness and isolation of individual support systems (Acikgöz, 2010; Kaypak, 2014); they are invisible within the urban

public space and limited in urban mobility. Women, who have difficulties in adaptation and who cannot benefit any means of help, constitute the group experiencing the traumatic effects of migration at its deepest (Demirler & Eşsiz, 2008). Increasing urban mobility and urban public space use constitute a significant part of the process of overcoming the barriers of social exclusion. Through spatial integration measures, the social inclusion of migrants in urban settings can be improved. Public spaces can play a key role in improving migrants' inclusion by acting as places for intercultural dialogue and exchange. Such gathering spaces allow for social mixing, civic participation, recreation, and a sense of belonging. It is necessary to fight spatial segregation through actions such as rebuilding districts in an integrated way; providing the most disadvantaged urban areas with quality public spaces and installations; promoting diverse uses of the land; removing architectural barriers that may isolate certain areas; and, finally, taking the gender variable into account in the urban make-up (UNESCO, 2013).

Women construct and negotiate public space. Public spaces in the neighborhood are important because knowledge about public spaces is both plentiful and manageable; as such, there is room for appropriation, that is, the creation of home territories where women are able to develop informal relations with neighbors (Ünlü Yücesoy, 2006). These spaces can be seen as transitional spaces -spaces between the safety of home and unknown places farther away where there is a degree of familiarity- where people need to cope with the anonymity and strangeness of the public space.

With this study, the aim is to understand the limitations of migrant women within and thus the barriers in front of their integration to the city, to where they have migrated. Knowledge and experience transfer for the social inclusion of migrant women is the major objective of this study. This research focuses on two parameters, use of public space and urban mobility, as measures of the social inclusion of migrant women to the place of immigration.

2. The limited public space of women

Three characteristics are often used to analyze the meanings of "public" and "private": access, agency of control, and interest (Benn & Gauss, 1983; Pitkin, 1981). The notion of legal ownership crosses all three characteristics (Benn & Gauss, 1983) so that what is publicly owned may still have restricted access and what is privately owned may have unrestricted access. Ownership, access, and control are all of key importance in analyzing public spaces. City streets, squares, and parks are usually both publicly owned and open to the entire population. Other spaces and buildings, privately owned and controlled, are open to the public but the owners may refuse or discourage entry by certain segments of the population (Brill, 1989). Examples are stores, shopping malls, and plazas. Other buildings are both publicly owned and open to the public but the segment of the population actually using them may be restricted through self-selection or social control. Yet all these spaces -streets, squares, parks, stores, malls, plazas, libraries, and museums- are loosely called "public" and, on some sense and varying degrees, they are (Franck & Paxson, 1989).

Public spaces vary in the degree of publicness they possess and exhibit: the greater the diversity of people and activities allowed and manifested in a space, the greater its publicness. Diversity of people includes variation in age, race, ethnicity, class, gender, and "otherness", that is, other variations

in appearance or behavior. A high degree of publicness also depends on the availability of different kinds of places within a space and on varying times of use. Diversity of activities and people does not mean that the more difference the better, but rather that a range of diversity is tolerated and encouraged, even with respect to some “fringe” users and activities. The concept of publicness is based on the assumption that face-to-face interaction between diverse types of people is valuable and that many different public spaces should provide for such interaction or, at least, for the co-presence of such diversity (Franck & Paxson, 1989).

One form of restriction concerns the type of activities women pursue when they do use public space. They are more likely to be engaged in necessary and “duty” activities, that is, in activities related to their domestic role and are less likely to be engaged in discretionary activities, in addition, women are more likely to feel they need a “legitimate” reason or an “excuse” for being in a public space (Brown, et al., 1986). Many of the features such as a space being indoors, having a high degree of visual access, and having amenities that support necessary activities or activities, that can be “excuses” for being in the space, may encourage women’s use of a public space (Franck & Paxson, 1989).

Women’s greater involvement in the domestic sphere by virtue of their childrearing and homemaking responsibilities suggests that they are more likely to frequent public spaces near the home. Research indicates that women are more likely to frequent local neighborhood open spaces than centrally located public open spaces (Franck & Paxson, 1989). Women when alone or accompanied by other women or children only, are more likely to use public spaces that they know are used by people like themselves.

Regardless of the type of space, women are less likely to be alone in the evening or at night (Köse & Erkan, 2014). In most public spaces, women unaccompanied are more likely to be engaged in an activity, including eating, talking, shopping, walking, reading, and caring for children. Women are apt to be more sensitive to characteristics they perceive as making a space safe. They are also more likely to choose spaces that are already populated, particularly by other women. Altogether, they are likely to be more particular about the characteristics of the space and of the people using it (Whyte, 1980).

Central public spaces are idealized by many urban policy makers, planners, and designers as “real meeting places” and “democratic places”, where all kinds of people from different origins can come together in a civilized way (Ünlü Yücesoy, 2006:148) It can be argued that depending on the individual’s possession of scripting and local knowledge, they perceive urban public space differently and connect to it a sense of belonging or strangeness (Ünlü Yücesoy, 2006: 154).

3. Why Berlin?

Germany has been a country of international exodus since more than a half century. Berlin, as the capital city of West Germany has been standing out in receiving migrants from all over the world but especially from Turkey and Poland. The first migrants have been invited as guest workers to Germany. The idea was to have these workers as “guests” in the country until the industry of Germany recovers, and thus no social investment has been made on the guest workers to include them into the cities, or country – but they have been

seen as “temporal”. Germany has understood its mistake by treating people as “temporally” staying as migrants started to settle families and started to have children and began to root in the cities they have come as guest workers. Since the acceptance of the mistake, Germany in general, but Berlin specifically (as a host city for many migrants) has been changing attitudes towards the investment in migrant groups and has been spending great budgets as well as human capital in trying to integrate “guest migrants” into the society and the system. Therefore, there is a considerable accumulation of experience and knowledge about the issues such as social inclusion, social integration, and participation of migrants in Germany politically, socially and economically.

In Turkey, on the other hand, the migration flows have been mainly on the national level. Governments have overlooked the problem of accommodating the migrants into the city, who provided the Turkey’s industry cheap labor to ensure the global competitiveness of Turkey’s industry. Migrant groups helped themselves by building up “gecekondu” houses, which grew into neighborhoods and became bad-functioning organs of the city. This “complaisance” was not only in terms of the accommodation but in terms of the social inclusion of the migrants into the city. Therefore, more or less, even the scales of migration are different, we can very easily argue that Turkey is going through a political ignorance process, where the needs of migrant groups are not heard and listened to. The cities and societies of great cities of Turkey already started to experience the problems caused by the huge flow of migration not only in terms of demographic booming, but also cities are becoming “ill bodies”, whose organs cannot function in harmony. Therefore, learning from experiences and applying these know-know into the urban politics especially in terms of social inclusion are considerably significant.

These reveals that there is a lot to learn from German experience; first, there is need in the urban politics of Turkey that the conceptualizations about social inclusion should be enhanced and amended according to the social, demographic, cultural, economic and political situation in the country and the related cities. Second, as the German experience puts forth very well, a very important aspect to pave the way for policy making and understanding the groups, for whom policies will be developed, is keeping elaborative statistics and data. This way monitoring will be facilitated and governing process can be measured as well as made transparent. Although this requires a top-to-down restructuring in the administration and institutionalization of the system, minor and prior steps can be also taken from the very bottom, from the neighborhoods via the *muhktar*-system.

4. Methodology innovation: Participatory action towards experience transfer (PATET)

There are a growing number of authors who argue that there is a case for integrating qualitative and quantitative research methods (Goodwin & Goodwin, 1984; Myers & Haase, 1989; McKinley, 1993; Barbour, 1999; Burnard & Hannigan, 2000; Bourgeois, 2002). The two types of research are designed to answer different sorts of questions, collect different types of data and produce different types of answers (Barbour, 1999). Researchers have combined the two approaches for a variety of reasons: for meeting different needs at different stages of a project; compensating for shortcomings in any one method; and triangulation (Mason, 1993; Ong, 1993; Barbour, 1999).

Knowledge transfer and exchange issues have captured the attention of a variety of academic disciplines such as health, management, education, marketing, and applied social research. For the purpose of this study, the term knowledge transfer will be used, which is defined as a “set of activities and approaches that are undertaken to move knowledge among those who have interests or needs in it” (Zarinpoush, et al., 2007). The knowledge transfer involves primarily a one-way flow of knowledge from the researchers to the practitioners (to Kartal City Council on behalf of Kartal District Municipality). However, this study also takes consideration that there is actually (even hidden) the multi-way movement of knowledge among researchers, practitioners, migrant women in Kurfali as well as the participants, coordinators and leaders of the project scrutinized in Berlin (Stadtteilmütter [StM] Neukölln) and women working as StM as well as former StM, recognizing that knowledge creation is not the sole domain of any one actor in a system.

Recent literature points to five key elements to consider when planning a knowledge transfer activity (Gowdy, 2006; Carpenter, et al., 2005; Zarinpoush & Gotlib Conn, 2006).

4.1 Audience

It is important to define the target audience for knowledge transfer and exchange efforts. The more defined a target audience, the easier it is to address the specific problems they face and the greater the potential for the uptake of information (The Williams Group for the David & Lucille Packard Foundation, 2003). Tailoring the knowledge transfer and exchange strategy to the audience’s needs, knowledge, and the sorts of practices they face on a daily basis is critical in an effective knowledge transfer and exchange activity (Zarinpoush, et al., 2007).

The audience has been defined as the migrant women for this study. Yet, to be able to grasp deeper information about the target group, qualitative and quantitative site survey has been conducted in the pilot study area. In this paper, findings of this survey will be recorded. Within the framework of the site survey 600 questionnaires have been made in the case study area, Hürriyet and Cumhuriyet Neighborhoods, a.k.a. Kurfali, Istanbul, Turkey. Questionnaires have been conducted between December 2012 and February 2013.

4.1.1 Sample design

In this study, only women between 25-55 years old have been questioned. In the study a time span from women’s lives has been selected where they theoretically would be expected to be at their highest mobility period. A woman who pursues the continuation of her studies is likely to depend on family and her mobility in the city or use of public spaces would not be an indicator for the average. A woman who is retired would also move in the city differently.

Kurfali is a settlement where mainly migrants or people with emigrational family history of lower income groups are residing. According to 2008 address based population census, Cumhuriyet Mahallesi has a population of 17.470 and Hürriyet Mahallesi 42.627. Unfortunately, Turkish Statistical Institute (TÜİK) does not announce updated neighborhood census date since 2008. 594 valid questionnaires have been conducted. The application of the questionnaires was face-to-face. As the questionnaire takes on the average 30 minutes, the team has questioned women mostly in their homes. Not to be biased in terms

of the representativeness of working women the questionnaire has been also done after 6 pm during the day and also during the weekends.

4.1.2 Demographic structure

48% of the interviewed women are between 25-35 years old. Women's education level is low; 67% of them are elementary school graduates; 20% are secondary school graduates; and 7% are uneducated. The mothers of 32% of the interviewed women are uneducated; 67% of them are elementary school graduates; and 1% is secondary school graduates; there are no graduates of higher educational institutions. The fathers of 86% of the interviewed women are elementary school graduates.

88% of the interviewed women are married. 87% of the interviewed women have children. Most of the women have two children (49%); 23% have only one children, 21% have three children. 25% of the children are 0-7 ages old. 65% of the interviewed women leave with their husbands and children (nuclear family).

4.1.3 Social structure

75% of the interviewed women are born outside of Istanbul. The families of the women born in Istanbul have arrived mostly to Istanbul 35-45 years ago. 30% Istanbul born women and 41% outside Istanbul born women have settled in Kurfali 0-10 years ago; 28% of Istanbul born women and 33% of outside Istanbul born women have settled in Kurfali 11-20 years ago. Kurfali is for 54% of the women the first place to settle when having arrived to Istanbul.

4.1.4 Economic structure

Only 11% of the interviewed women are employed. From those who are unemployed at the moment, only 19% is willing to work; the most important reason (%56) for these women why they do not work is that there is no one to take of children during work hours. Working women remarked that they are employed as charlady, laborer, and handicraftswomen. Working place of most of the women is in Kartal.

In parallel to their non-employment, most of the women do not have an income. Total household income varies mainly between 1.000-1.500 TL. 85% of the women are insured by Social Security Institution; 12% of them have no insurance at all. 4% of the interviewed women remarked they are receiving social aid.

4.1.5 Public space use

To measure women's awareness about the public spaces in their neighborhood, they have been given a list of public spaces and asked to tell whether these places exist in their neighborhoods. If they answered positively, the frequency of their usage and satisfaction of these places have been questioned. Most of the women remarked that there is no public education center, cafes, restaurants, tea gardens, parks, cultural center, and sports center in Kurfali. Those women who confirmed the existence of these places mentioned that they are finding these places insufficient.

Women usually did not know about the public spaces to gather and social facilities in their neighborhoods as well. However, more than 95% of the women could tell that are community health center, grocery, sanctuaries, playgrounds, kinder garden, elementary school in their neighborhood.

Playground is also standing out by being confirmed about its existence and not being found sufficient. Because of the insufficiency problem, there is a high percentage of women who remarked that they are not using playgrounds at all. As playgrounds are directly relevant to children's use, it can be seen women are more sensitive about the level of their satisfaction. As consistent with this finding, the high level of dissatisfaction about kinder garden and elementary schools is not a coincidence, as these are places that women are distinctly familiar with. Also during the non-structured interviews with women, this phenomenon, that for women children have the priority even above their existence, was remarkable.

Community health center, bazaar, supermarkets are standing out by the high frequency of being used. However the level of dissatisfaction is also high for these places. This leads us to the idea that because of the problems women are facing in such public spaces, they are reluctant in using or exploring new public spaces, which are rather optional to use. Thus, especially those public spaces such as tea gardens, parks, recreational and sports facilities, as well as cultural center, which are not well-known by women, could be made more attractive while observing the difficulties women are tired of in the public spaces they have to use and making amendments accordingly.

Women were also asked whether they can go alone and anytime they want to these public spaces mentioned above. 92% of the women responded that they can do and do not experience any difficulties. Women who remarked they experience difficulties and responded that they cannot go alone/anytime they like commented that they do not have the financial means to go or that it is too expensive to go. However, most of the courses offered and engagement in activities within the cultural center and social facilities are free of charge. That these facilities are located within walking distance in the neighborhood is also worth to mention. Therefore that lack of financial means and the expensiveness being given as excuses will be explored extensively in the coming steps of the study. Still, the first thing coming to mind is that women do not know where these facilities are located, how to access these places and there is a lack of information or a deficiency in the information dissemination about the services provided in the public facilities.

It can easily be said that women are aware of public institutions and places which are related to housework and children's education and health. On the other hand, they are not aware of the public spaces and institutions which are related to their individual personal development. It is also striking, that public facilities, which they remarked as "missing" in the neighborhood such as recreational spaces and institutions for extracurricular time activities, actually exist in the very center of Kurfali. Those women, who confirmed the existence of these spaces, could not give a relevant response for their satisfaction level. This might be associated with the notion that women do not know what to expect from such public spaces. Again, it is worth to mention that the concern of women by remarking these places as missing and wanting the municipality to fill this gap, they also mention that these places are required for their children, and there is no mention of themselves as individuals.

4.2 Message

When preparing a message to transfer, it is also necessary to consider what information will be most useful to the audience (Zarinpoush, et al., 2007).

4.2.1 Stadtteilmütter Neukölln project

As Rakodi (2010) comments that the women and planning problems are not particularly different in the developing and late-industrializing countries from those in the West but rather they are more intense. Not being able to get into communication with public beings, women are excluded from being the teller of their own stories. Thus, they are not visible, known, heard in any channel, the history and the literature of the public. The communication of migrant women to the city and the greater society of the city, as well as its economic systems can be established via the public institutions, events, activities or in public spaces. This communication can be resembled to a “language” that migrant women are not capable of speaking because of various reasons. This study takes the position, if this language becomes familiar to migrant women and if they feel no obstacle in speaking and communicating in this “language”, then the inclusion process can be accelerated. If women cannot speak the language spoken in the public space of the city they have migrated to and if they also lack the relatives or any connection with a public body which would be of help, they get separated from the social environment they were accustomed to, they feel alien to the place they moved in, and they feel insecure even ensuring their daily survival.

So, language is not just an etymological phenomenon, but also an aggregate of systems, values, and perceptions which are attributed to the urban economic and social systems via the dilemmas of public-private and rural-urban. A good example is given in the article of Demirler and Essiz (2008); they found out that the migrant women who have settled in Tarlabaşı, Istanbul are helping women who recently move to the neighborhood by accompanying them throughout the neighborhood via “orientation tours”, where they introduce them the neighborhood, to the local shopkeepers and groceries, and to make them “known” to the inhabitants of the neighborhood. Taking the significance of the “public language” of the place of immigration, within this PhD thesis, a model project from Berlin, namely *Stadtteilmütter Neukölln* (Neighborhood Mothers), which is inherently working like a mutual help between migrant women using their self-potentials, is scrutinized in depth and which can be institutionalized but in terms of transferability from Berlin and applicability in Istanbul.

The project is implemented within the fully cooperation of District Council of Neukölln, Senate for Urban Development and the Environment, JobCenter Neukölln, Senate for Senate for Integration, Labor and Women’s Issues, primary schools of the Quartiersmanagement-zones and the parent cafes, initiatives and projects developed around and within this zones, Quartier advisory boards and bureaus, Neukölln Adult Education Center, the local networks of parents and education, and Goldnetz GmbH, which is an educational institution experienced in and acknowledged with its working with migrants.

The project started as a micro scheme in 2005 and expanded to all Quartiersmanagement-zones of Neukölln in 2006. The project is currently funded by the Bezirksamt Neukölln and the Senate for Urban Development and the Environment (via “Soziale Stadt” program) and the women employed as Stadtteilmütter are paid by the JobCenter Neukölln within the framework of job creation scheme with the co-financing of Senate for Integration, Labor and Women’s Issues.

The project has until today more than 300 women (especially with Turkish and Arabic origins) as Stadtteilmütter qualified. Over 5.000 families have been respectively ten times visited within the framework of the model projects in the past years. According to the evaluation report for the Stadtteilmütter project for 2006-2008 period, Koch (2009) notes that the families that were visited were primarily attracted to the district mothers' social networks. The fact that the district mothers recruited to the project came from the same communities as the respective target groups and could therefore establish a "cultural link" without any language barriers, later played a role in achieving co-operation with the target groups.

The wonder of Berlin's "district mothers" campaign is that it recruits Turkish women themselves to help their sisters (and their families) forge a path to social engagement, new skills, timely health care, and greater chances for success in German society (Peirce, 2009).

The educated Stadtteilmütter visit other families within their community in Neukölln. Each family is ten times visited and gets informed by and receives necessary materials from Stadtteilmütter. Stadtteilmütter are social-pedagogically accompanies, receive for their effort a fee or are employed temporarily within the framework of *Beschäftigungsmaßnahme* for 30 hours per week and financed through the JobCenter Neukölln. Some women could enter into contact with third party employers during their employment as Stadtteilmütter and find a place in the job market.

During the interview conducted with Maria Macher, the project leader of Stadtteilmütter in Neukölln on the 29.05.2012, she noted that it is becoming apparent that the target groups (families visited by Stadtteilmütter) have a stronger awareness of the significance of an active involvement in rearing and educating children and encouraging them in early childhood. They seem, as a result, more highly motivated to change their behavior. So, a similar change in behavior towards environment/built physical space as well as urban awareness might be expected if the program or project is especially developed accordingly.

The women qualified as Stadtteilmütter did not only change their behavior in terms of the issues that they have been educated and qualified to educate others about, but also their sensitivities towards the society that they are living in also changes; in a manner so that they wanted to know more, they wanted to learn more and they wanted to feel more. In the evaluation results, the most notable changes were clearly to be seen in the target group associated with the Stadtteilmütter, who have been involved in the project the longest (Koch). On the whole, Stadtteilmütter are given the possibility of multiple integration, that is to say, they have the opportunity, through their involvement in the project, to integrate not only in the receiving society, but also in their respective migrant society. The district mothers' multilingual abilities and their interaction with the community are proof that, when given the chance, less well-educated social classes can also achieve multiple integration. This means that integration into the receiving society must not necessarily be associated with the loss of one's native language or the surrender of the original way of life and contacts within the ethnic group. This evaluation result is especially of great significance, if it is accepted that the side-effect or at least an intended effect, which however was actually not even the first priority of the project at all can come to the fore at the end. Within the PhD thesis the women, educated and qualified

as *Stadtteilmütter* are of more significance than the families visited, as the life expectations, urban realities and experiences and the mobility of these women increase tremendously via such projects.

In this project, mothers are educated to become „district mothers“ and then they pass their experience and knowledge to other mothers/parents in their neighborhood. This idea fits totally with the example given above, where migrant women in Tarlabasi do such experience sharing within each other voluntarily and in an unorganized way. *Stadtteilmütter* Project allows women to do this in a more organized way, and also outside their close social networks, and also get paid in return. This is also for most of the *Stadtteilmütter* the first step of entering into the job market in Berlin.

4.3 Method

Knowledge is most effectively exchanged when using multiple methods (Lavis, et al., 2003; Gowdy, 2006; Norman & Huerta, 2006). Thus, all the different means used throughout the focus group studies will enhance the effectiveness of the knowledge transfer. Besides, being aware of the knowledge transfer is not a one-way flow of information, researchers aim to bring as many as possible actors together throughout the process.

- Being the most powerful local actor, the participation of the municipality to this process has been crucially important. For this, researchers have made a cooperation agreement with the Kartal City Council under the name of Kartal District Municipality. According to the agreement, throughout the study process both parties are obliged to provide any information and aid to each other. It is also an intention of both the City Council and the researchers, that this pilot study will open up the path for the institutionalization of a project with a greater scope to increase migrant women’s urban mobility and public space use. Both parties agree that this is important for the social inclusion of migrant women to the city they have migrated; and social inclusion of vulnerable groups is one of the criteria to ensure social sustainability.

- An introduction meeting has been organized with the main actors of the case study area with the help of the City Council; representatives of public schools, health centers, cultural center, public education center, women cooperative, and mukhtars have been invited to the meeting. In this meeting, the thesis and its aims as well as the pilot project to be undertaken have been told to the actors; and the actors have given voice one by one to tell about the primary problems they are facing in Kurfali within the framework of the theme of the study.

4.4 Messenger

In this study, researchers are the messenger delivering the message to the audience. The World Bank (Knowledge and Learning Group Africa Region, 2005) suggests that messengers should possess a number of key behavioral competencies, such as listening, patience, humility, and flexibility in order to gain the trust and respect of the audience and better interact with them. Thus, researchers are aware of building this “trustworthy” position among the audience by keeping close contact with the audience and letting them also interrogate the researchers. Still, there is a natural barrier between the women subject to this study and the researcher, as she is not married, not a mother, and having a different cultural, social, and educational background.

Abernathy, et al. (2000) mention that audiences respond to familiarity and are more receptive if the information is presented by someone who is seen to be in a similar position to their own (for example, a colleague or someone they know from the community). Therefore, migrant women from Berlin will be brought together with migrant women in Kurfali in a workshop to share their common grounds with each other and to prove and confirm that the information disseminated is valid.

5. Evaluation

A very significant factor in mitigating the social exclusion of migrant women is to increase urban knowledge accumulation and so to provide opportunities for higher mobility. The increase in knowledge accumulation can be realized via taking advantage of urban services and activities. Inter-institutional cooperation is substantial, as urban services and activities cannot be used efficiently by various groups with varying time and spatial perceptions.

As proven by the StM Project in Neukölln, Berlin, communicating with mediatory women, who can speak the same language with migrant women, plays a very important role in increasing the public space use and urban mobility. In this process, both mediatory women as well as informant women present a positive development and start to participate into the city and urban systems.

Having conducting PATET, it has been observed that women in the focus groups studies have changed their perceptions and attitudes towards urban barriers. They gained greater awareness about what they can ask from local administrative units. Not only women, but also the local administration has agreed on the necessity of cooperation between research and practice. Changes in institutional and voluntary actors are also expected. Insomuch, institutional perception proves to be a great essentialness in hindering migrant women's exclusion.

References

- Abernathy, T., Coutts, J. & Royce, D., (2000). Knowledge Transfer: Looking Beyond Health. Retrieved from http://www.cfhi-fcass.ca/migrated/pdf/event_reports/ktransfer_e.pdf
- Acikgöz, R., (2010). Kadın Yoksulluğu Üzerine Bir İnceleme. *Yardım ve Dayanışma*, 1(2), 45-60.
- Arendt, H., (1958). *The Human Condition*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Barbour, R., (1999). The Case of Combining Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches in Health Services Research. *Journal of Health Services Research and Policy*, 4, 39-43.
- Benn, S. & Gauss, G., (1983). The Public and the Private. In: S. Benn & G. Gauss, *Public and Private in Social Life*. New York: St. Martin's Press, 3-30.
- Bernath, J., Radeljic, J. & Rothermel, S., (2009). The Quartiersmanagement as a Local Strategy for Integration. Retrieved from <http://www.humanityinaction.org/knowledgebase/34-the-quartiersmanagement-as-a-local-strategy-for-integration>
- Bourgeois, P., (2002). Anthropology and Epidemiology on Drugs: the Challenges of Cross-methodological and Theoretical Dialogue.

- International Journal of Drug Policy*, 23, 259-269.
- Brill, M., (1989). Transformation, Nostalgia, and Illusion in Public Life and Public Place. In: I. Altman & E. Zube, *Public Places and Spaces*. New York: Springer, 7-29.
- Brown, D., Sijpkens, P. & Maclean, M., (1986). The Community Role of Public Indoor Space. *Journal of Architecture and Planning Research*, 3, 161-172.
- Burnard, P. & Hannigan, B., (2000). Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches in Mental Health Nursing: Moving the Debate Forwards. *Journal of Psychiatric and Mental Health Nursing*, 7, 1-6.
- Carpenter, D., Nieva, V., Albaghal, T. & Sorra, J., (2005). Development of a Planning Tool to Guide Research Dissemination. In: K. Henriksen, J. Battles & E. Marks, *Advances in Patient Safety: From Research to Implementation (Volume 4: Programs, Tools, and Products)*. Rockville (MD): Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality, 83-91.
- Demirler, D. & Eşsiz, V., (2008). Zorunlu Göç Deneyimini Kadınlardan Dinlemek: Bir İmkan ve İmkansızlık Olarak Dil. In: N. Mutluer, *Cinsiyet Halleri: Türkiye’de Toplumsal Cinsiyetin Kesişim Sınırları*. İstanbul: Varlık Yayınları, 165-180.
- Erman, T. (1998). Semi-public/Semi-private Spaces in the Experience of Turkish Women in a Squatter Settlement, *Stadtplanung, Special Issue for “Symposium Migration und Öffentlicher Raum in Bewegung”*, 22, 40-51.
- Franck, K. & Paxson, L., (1989). Women and Urban Public Space: Research, Design, and Policy Issues. In: I. Altman & E. Zube, *Public Places and Spaces*. New York: Springer, 121-146.
- Goodwin, L. & Goodwin, W., (1984). Qualitative versus Quantitative Research or Qualitative and Quantitative Research. *Nursing Research*, 33, 378-380.
- Goffman, E., (1963). *Behavior in Public Places: Notes on Social Organization of Gatherings*. New York, NY: The Free Press.
- Gowdy, A., (2006). Knowledge Transfer and Helath Networks: Literature Review. Retrieved from <http://www.link-ages.ca/pdfs/researchdocs/knowledgetransfer.pdf>
- Greed, C., (1994). *Women and Planning*. New York: Routledge.
- Kaypak, Ş., (2014). Toplumsal Cinsiyet Bakış Açısından Kente Bakmak. *Niğde Üniversitesi İİBF Dergisi*, 7:1, 344-57.
- Knowledge and Learning Group Africa Region, (2005). *Capacity Enhancement through Knowledge Transfer: a Behavioral Framework for Reflection, Action and Results*, The World Bank.
- Köse, N. & Erkan, N., (2014). Kentsel Mekan Örgütlenmesinin Yaşlıların Kentsel Etkinlikleri Üzerindeki Etkisi: İstanbul ve Viyana Örneği. *METU JFA*, 31:1, 39-66.
- Lavis, J. et al., (2003). How Can Research Organisations More Effectively Transfer Research Knowledge to Decision Makers?. *The Milbank Quarterly*, 81(2), 221-248.
- Mason, S., (1993). Employing Qualitative and Quantitative Methods in One Study. *British Journal of Nursing*, 2, 869-872.
- McKinley, T., (1993). The Promotion of Health through Socio-political Change: Challenges for Research and Policy. *Social Sciences in Medicine*, 36, 109-113.
- Myers, S. & Haase, J., (1989). Guidelines for Integrating Quantitative and Qualitative Approaches. *Nursing Research*, 38, 798-799.
- Norman, C. & Huerta, T., (2006). Knowledge Transfer and Exchange through

- Social Networks: Building Foundations for a Community of Practice within Tobacco Control. *Implementation Science*, 1(20).
- Ong, B., (1993). *The Practice of Health Services Research*. London: Chapman and Hall.
- Pedraza, S., (1991). Women and Migration: Social Consequences of Gender. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 17, 303-325.
- Pitkin, H., (1981). Justice: On Relaying Private and Public. *Political Theory*, 9, 327-352.
- Terlinden, U., (2003). Public Man and Private Woman: Discourse and Practice in Western Societies. In: U. Terlinden, Hrsg. *City and Gender: International Discourse on Gender, Urbanism and Architecture*. Opladen: Leske + Budrich , 41-56.
- The Williams Group for the David & Lucille Packard Foundation, (2003). *Marketing Your Knowledge: A Report to Philanthropy's R&D Organizations*
- UNESCO, (2013). Inclusion Through Access to Public Space. Retrieved from <http://www.unesco.org/new/en/social-and-human-sciences/themes/urban-development/migrants-inclusion-in-cities/good-practices/inclusion-through-access-to-public-space/>
- Ünlü Yücesoy, E., (2006). *Everyday Urban Public Space: Turkish Immigrant Women's Perspective*. Amsterdam: Het Spinhuis Publisher.
- Whyte, W., (1980). *The Social Life or Small Urban Spaces*. Washington, DC: Conservation Foundation.
- Zarinpoush, F. & Gotlib Conn, L., (2006). Knowledge Transfer. Retrieved from <http://envision.ca/cvi/docs/KnowledgeTransfer01-05-2006.pdf>
- Zarinpoush, F., Von Sychowski, S. & Sperling, J., (2007). *Effective Knowledge Transfer and Exchange for Nonprofit Organizations: a Framework*, Ontario: Imagine Canada.

Göçmen kadınların kente entegrasyonu ve hareketlilik: Bilgi ve deneyim transferine dayalı pilot proje bulguları

Çalışmalar göçmen kadınların kültürel çatışmalar ve destek sistemleri eksikliği (Acıkgöz, 2010) nedeniyle sosyal ve ekonomik açıdan dezavantajlı olduğunu göstermektedir. Demirel ve Eşsiz'e (2008:165) göre göç şehrine uyumda zorluklarla karşı karşıya kalan ve herhangi bir destek sisteminden faydalanamayan göçmen kadınlar, göç süreçlerinin olumsuz etkilerinden en travmatik şekilde etkilenen gruptur. Kırdan kente göç eden koyu ataerkil topluluklarda kadınların kente sosyal ve ekonomik uyumu özellikle zordur. Bu nedenle göçmen kadınlar kamusal alanda görünmez olmalarının yanı sıra, kentteki hareketlilikleri de çok sınırlıdır.

Yeni göç edilen kentteki ikamet süresi uzadıkça, komşuluğa dayalı sosyal ağlar sıklaşır ve bu, kadınların kente içerilmesinde önem arz eder. Göç edilen kente entegrasyon süresince, ev-mahalle ekseninde sıkışıp kalan kadınlar tarafından mahalle ölçeğinde örülen sosyal ve ekonomik ilişkiler, toplumsal cinsiyeti göz ardı eden planlama uygulamalarında göz ardı edilir. Kadın, göç edilen yere sosyal ve ekonomik entegrasyonun sağlanması ve mekansal kimlik geliştirme açısından göç sürecinin önemli aktörlerinden biri olmasına rağmen (Pedraza, 1991), göçün ve göçmen grupların kente uyum süreçlerinin okunmasında kadınların rolü ihmal edildiği gibi, göçmen kadınların özel ihtiyaçları ve hassasiyetleri için yerel yönetimler tarafından da yeterli çözüm sunulmaz.

Yerel yönetim seviyesinde planlama ve tasarım alanında üretilecek yenilikçi çözümler sayesinde, öncelikle kente göç eden grupların kente sosyal içerilmelerinin önündeki engeller hafifletilebilir. Kamusal alan kullanımının, kentsel faaliyetlere katılımın ve kentsel hareketliliğin artırılması, dışlanma etkilerinin hafifletilmesinde önemli politika araçlarıdır. Kamusal alanlar, kültürlerarası diyalog ve alışverişin sağlanmasına olanak sunan yerler olarak göçmenlerin içerilmesinin geliştirilmesinde önemli bir rol

oynayabilir. Bu tür toplanma alanları sosyal karıştırma, sivil katılım, eğlence ve aidiyet duygusu için imkan yaratır (UNESCO, 2013).

Bu dinamiklerin analizi ve büyük kentteki dezavantajlılık seviyesi görece en yüksek olan gruplardan birisi olan göçmen kadınların kentsel sistemlerle uyumu ile ilgili faaliyet ve hizmetlerin sağlanmasında birincil sorumlu ve yetkili, yerel yönetimlerdir. Yerel yönetimlerin bu durumu değiştirmek ve göçmen kadınları güçlendirmek için projeleri olabilir; ama yönetimler ağırlıklı olarak siyasi kaygılarla motive edilir ve kamusal alanda görünür olmayan göçmen kadınlara erişim yetersiz düzeyde kalırsa, doğru analizler yapılamadığı ve sorun doğru tespit edilemediği için, bu projelerin başarılı olma ihtimali düşük kalır.

2013 yılında İTÜ Bilimsel Araştırma Projesi Fonu, Almanya DAAD (Alman Akademik Değişim Servisi) finansal destekleri ve Kartal Kent Meclisi desteği ile yürütülen “Göçmen Kadınların Kentsel Hareketliliğinin Artırılması - Berlin’den İstanbul’a Deneyim Aktarımı: Kurfalı, Kartal’da bir Pilot Çalışması” doktora tez çalışması, sahada gerçekleştirilen Kadın.NET pilot projesi ile temellendirilmiştir. Bu pilot proje ile göçmen kadınların kente entegrasyonu konusundaki çalışmalara katkı sağlanmaya çalışılmıştır. Bu makale, Kadın.NET projesinin sonuçlarına dayanmaktadır. Kadın.NET projesi kadınların kent içi hareketlilikleri ve ekonomik sisteme entegrasyonlarındaki en önemli engellerin sadece fiziki engeller olmadığı yeterli sosyal destekleyici kurum eksikliği ve var olan sosyal destekleyici projelerde ise katılımcı yaklaşımların eksikliğinin etkili olabileceği kabulü üzerine kurgulanmıştır. Projenin sürdürülebilirliğinin sağlanması ve yerel yönetim organları aracılığıyla yeni politika önerilerinin hayata geçirilmesinin mümkün kılıcı proje ortakları Kartal Kent Konseyi ve Kartal Belediyesi’dir.

Araştırma alanı seçiminde kent ve kentli toplumların oluşumundan bu yana, kent, hem fiziksel hem de toplumsal bariyerleri ile toplumu oluşturan farklı nitelik ve nicelikteki toplulukların çeşitli sebeplerle dışlandığı mekanlar olmuştur. Araştırma alanı olarak kentsel entegrasyona müsaade etmeyen bir fiziksel yapısı olduğu daha önce yapılan çalışmalar ile de ortaya konmuş olan İstanbul Kartal ilçesinde E-5 karayolunun kuzeyinde kalan ve 1960’lardan bugüne şehirde ekonomik bir faaliyette tutunmak amacıyla İstanbul’a göç eden grupların yerleştiği Kurfalı (Hürriyet ve Cumhuriyet Mahalleleri) seçilmiştir.

Bu makalede, Kurfalı Hürriyet ve Cumhuriyet Mahallelerinde yaşayan kadınların göç edilen kentteki deneyimleri, kamusal alan kullanımları ve kentsel hareketliliklerinin ve engellerin incelendiği saha çalışmalarının bulgularına değinilecek ve saha bulgusu sonuçlarına dayanan metodoloji üzerinde durulacaktır. Katılımcı araştırma yöntemleri uygulanan araştırmanın verileri Eylül 2012 ve Kasım 2013 tarihleri arasında elde edilmiştir.

Araştırmanın örnek kütlesini İstanbul, Kartal, Kurfalı’da yaşayan 25-55 yaş arası göçmen kadınlar oluşturmaktadır. Kurfalı, İstanbul’a Erzincan’dan 35-45 yıl öncesinde göç ederek gelenler tarafından oluşan ve daha sonra nüfus artışına bağlı olarak idari olarak Hürriyet ve Cumhuriyet Mahallesi olarak ikiye bölünmüş bir semttir. Bu çalışmada hem nitel ve hem de nicel araştırmaların sonuçları ile desteklendiği üzere, çocukların varlığı, özellikle göçmen kadınlar için, sınırlı “yaşam alanlarını” genişletmek için önemli bir fırsat olarak ortaya çıkmaktadır. Kentsel hareketlilikleri sınırlı olan göçmen kadınlar için çocuklar, yeni yerlere giderken kendilerini güvenli hissetmeleri, yeni tanışıklıklar edinmeleri, yeni sosyal ağlara katılmaları ve günlük rutinlerine yeni duraklar eklemelerine vesile oldukları için hareketlilik arttırıcı nitelikte çok önemli bir rol oynamaktadır.

Kartal, İstanbul’un tarihi kent merkezinden uzakta olan Anadolu yakasında sahile olan yakınlığı sebebiyle banliyö yerleşimi niteliği taşıyan ve uzun süre kentsel küçük sanayiye ev sahipliği yapmış bir ilçedir. Ancak İstanbul’un demografik ve mekânsal gelişimi sırasında Kartal bu niteliğini kaybetmiş ve özellikle de ev sahipliği yaptığı sanayi sebebiyle oldukça hızla göç almıştır. Kartal, İstanbul Büyükşehir Belediyesi Metropolitan Planlama ve Kentsel Tasarım Merkezi (IMP) tarafından geliştirilen stratejik planlarda Anadolu yakasının gelecekteki yeni kent merkezi olarak tanımlanmıştır. Kartal’ın göç almasına ve kullanım değişiklikleri görülmesine yol açan bu kararlar birlikte, Kartal’ın coğrafik özellikleri de bu ilçenin çalışma alanı olarak seçilmesinde önemli rol oynamıştır.

Kartal E-5 tarafından hem fiziksel, hem ekonomik; hem de sosyal yapısı bakımından ikiye bölünen bir ilçedir. E-5'in kuzey kesiminde yer alan mahalleleri plansız yerleşim alanlarından oluşmakta ve ciddi bir dönüşüm baskısı altındadır. Pilot çalışmaya konu seçilen Cumhuriyet ve Hürriyet Mahalleleri, Kartal'ın E-5 kuzeyinde kalan diğer mahallelerine göre daha homojen bir yapı sergilemekte (aynı bölgeden gelen kişilerin yaşadığı mahalle olma özelliklerini sürdürmekte) ve TÜİK verilerine göre de Kartal'ın en çok göç alan mahalleleri olma özelliklerini sürdürmektedirler.

Çalışmada niceliksel tespit aşamasının ardından proje alanında uygulanacak olan katılımcı eylem araştırmasına yönelik metodların uygulanacağı bir süreçte, kadınlarda kentsel kamusal alan kullanımı ve farkındalığı hakkında algısal ve pratik davranışsal değişikliklerin oluşmasını sağlayıcı bir model geliştirilmeye çalışılmıştır. Bunun, kadınların kentsel hareketliliğin artmasında ve dolayısıyla kente hem ekonomik hem de sosyal anlamda entegrasyonun gerçekleştirilmesinde bir pilot çalışma (Kadın. NET) niteliği taşıması beklenmektedir.

Kurfalı'da anket yapılan ve odak grup çalışmalarına katılan kadınların büyük çoğunluğunun erken yasta evlendikleri ve yine erken yasta çocuk sahibi oldukları görülmüştür. Göçmen kadınların çocukları ve çocuklarının ihtiyaçları ile ilgili kamusal alanlara dair farkındalıkları yüksek olduğu ve ev işleri ile çocukların eğitim ve sağlıkları ile ilgili kamu kurumları ve kamusal alanlarının yerlerini rahatlıkla tarif edebildikleri gözlemlenmiştir.

Göçmenlerin kente entegrasyonu ile ilgili uzun süredir akademik ve yerel yönetsel çalışmalar yapılan Berlin'de, göçmen nüfusun yoğunlukta olduğu Neukölln ve Kreuzberg bölgelerinde derinlemesine mülakatlar yapılmış, bu konuda çalışan gönüllüler, yerel yönetim yetkilileri ve proje yöneticileri ile görüşülmüş, Kurfalı'daki soruna benzerlik teşkil eden sorunların çözümleri için geliştirilmiş sistemler incelenmiştir. Saha çalışmaları ile Kurfalı'nın iç dinamikleri ortaya çıktıkça, Berlin'de incelenen projelerden Örnek Anne Projesi (Stadtteilmütter Project) Kurfalı'ya deneyim aktarımı yapılabilecek "en iyi uygulama" olarak tercih edilmiştir. Bu proje katılımcı tekniklerle yakinen incelenmiş, Kurfalı'da yapılan odak grup çalışmaları ve Kartal Kent Konseyi ile yapılan görüşmeler sonucunda da bu proje deneyiminin Kurfalı'ya nasıl aktarılacağına dair müzakerelerde bulunulmuştur.

Bu çalışma, katılımcı eylem dayanan bir bilgi aktarımı sürecini anlatmaktadır. Sahada gerçekleştirilen nitel ve nicel çalışmalar aynı zamanda önemli bir yöntem denemesi olmuştur. Katılımcı eylem dayanan ve bilgi ve deneyim aktarımının öneminin vurgulandığı bu süreçte, göçmen kadınların kente entegrasyonunun, kentsel hareketliliklerinin artışı ve yerel yönetimlerin destek katılımcı programları ile sağlanabileceğinin test edildiği ve uygulanabilir yöntem çıktıları olan bir pilot çalışma yönetilmiştir. Aynı anda iki farklı şehirde yapılan saha çalışmaları ile hem nitel hem de nicel veri toplanmış, süreç içerisinde sahadan alınan bilgiye göre sürecin gelecek aşamaları revize edilmiştir. Böylelikle projenin başında ortaya konan amaca ulaşmanın yolu, projenin tüm aktörleri ile birlikte revize edilerek ve sahadan gelen bilgi ile desteklenerek ortaya konmuştur. Pilot proje kapsamında bu karma yöntemler dizgisi, **PATET** (Participatory Action towards Experience Transfer / Deneyim Aktarımına Yönelik Katılımcı Eylem) olarak tanımlanmıştır. PATET'in geliştirilmesi ve uygulanmasının yerel yönetim, kentsel politika ve kent sosyolojisi alanlarında yapılacak çalışmalara katkı sağlayabileceği öngörülmektedir.